Twaweza 2022: ANNUAL REPORT



ANNUAL REPORT 2022

Introduction

"The Citizen Story is about the empowerment of us all to co-invent and nurture our own futures. The Citizenship of this book is not about the passport we hold, and it goes far beyond the duty to vote in elections. It's a state of engagement, more verb than noun. We look around, identify the domains where we have some influence, and we roll up our sleeves and make things happen."

This quote is from the foreword in Jon Alexander's new book, *Citizens: Why the key to fixing everything is all of us.* Jon moderated the panel I was on at the European Regional Meeting of the Open Government Partnership in October 2022. His book challenges the Subject Story that we, as subjects, are dependent on a higher authority whom we are duty-bound to obey. He also debunks the Consumer Story in which our role is to be independent consumers, endowed with rights, wants (more than needs) and choices.

The Citizen Story is precisely what Twaweza focuses on. Our motto is *Twaweza Ni Mimi, Ni Wewe, Ni Sisi (Twaweza is Me, it is You, it is Us).* This Annual Report for 2022 reports on the fourth year of our 2019-23 strategy. It showcases how citizens across Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania are "looking around to see where they can make change, raising their voices, rolling up their sleeves and making things happen."

Our activities in Mission One, dedicated to demonstrating citizen agency are producing tangible results in two main areas. First, public services are improving in many villages across 10 districts in Uganda and Tanzania as a result of the structured, persistent citizen engagement catalysed by animators. For example, boreholes and cattle dips have been revived, school classrooms and toilets have been completed, and exam results improved as a citizen-organised school meal program was instituted. Second, local governance in most villages is showing signs of improving. As a result of citizen pressure, village income and expenditure statements are being disclosed, the relationship between elected and appointed authorities, and citizens is improving, albeit painstakingly, and increasing numbers of citizens are engaging in the regular meetings where decisions are made.

In Mission Two, the citizens' voices we have amplified through Sauti za Wananchi, continue to be demonstrably influential in shaping public policy. The most compelling evidence is the government of Tanzania's decision to reduce the mobile money transactions levy by 40% in response to the robust public discussion that was catalyzed by the first launch of a Sauti brief in four years. The election managers in Kenya, the tax authorities in Uganda and the county government in Makueni (Kenya) have all used Sauti insights to inform their policies and actions in a bid to respond to citizens views, experiences and priorities.

We report encouraging effects of our work in Mission Three of promoting and protecting civic space, focused on Tanzania. First, as a result of our partnership with the Legal and Human Rights Centre (LHRC) and others, problematic clauses in the criminal justice legislation were deleted and all amendments to the COSTECH Act that would have muzzled independent researchers were withdrawn. Secondly, our strategic partnerships with Equality for Growth (EfG), the Creative Industries Network Tanzania (CINT), the digital-first media house, The Chanzo are helping to strengthen them individually, while deepening the civil society ecosystem in the country. Finally, we are proud of supporting the strategic refresh of the Tanzania Centre for Democracy (TCD). Their

hosting of the President at a successful conference on political reconciliation was a milestone of Tanzania's political calendar.

We are a committed learning organization and here are the observations and lessons we are drawing form the year's activities and achievements:

- We are seeding a movement of active citizens, and we need to prepared to push back against entrenched power structures.
- The assumption that young people are more active and will sustain animation work needs to be qualified.
- We are learning how to managing expectations while maintaining motivation
- Our hunch around the power of progressive insiders to advance change, seems to be bearing out.
- Productive citizen local government engagement can be usefully unlocked by local intermediaries and we can play an important role connecting national and subnational actors.
- There is growing demand for high-quality locally relevant journalism, but its supply needs ongoing support.
- Sauti za Wananchi remains powerfully influential.
- We continue to be an important hub of information, ideas, execution and strategic financing for mission-aligned civil society partners across the three countries.
- The risk of spinning your wheels in policy engagement is very high.
- "All that glitters is not gold!"
- Evidence, voice and collaboration work...sometimes.

On the global stage, Twaweza had the privilege of co-chairing the Open Government Partnership (OGP) together with the Government of Italy. Together we initiated a detailed strategic review of the partnership and helped guide the development of the strategy for 2023-2027. We co-hosted two regional meetings in Europe in October, and for Africa and the Middle East, in November, and helped welcome the largest intake of local government members in the partnership's history.

During the year, we welcomed two new Board members. Professor Mussa Assad and Advcate Thomas Bahame Nyanduga are seasoned financial and legal professionals, who have served in Tanzania's public service with distinction. They have already made their mark in Twaweza through their penetrating engagement and guidance on our governance.

Finally, we are pleased to report that we have delivered an excellent, unqualified audited financial report a testament to the high quality of financial probity with which we steward the financial resources with which we are entrusted.

ANNUAL REPORT 2022: Part 1 – Stories of Change

FIL

ANNUAL REPORT 2022

PART ONE

Stories of Change

MISSION 1 – DEMONSTRATING CITIZEN AGENCY

Putting the system in service of citizens: training communities and officials on access to information

Uganda

In 2022, we convened local officials, change agents, local journalists, active citizens and local civil society in Kamuli, Kole, Moyo and Namutumba to be trained on access to information.

Full results from monitoring will be available in 2023 but anecdotally we are seeing important changes:

- Change agents, journalists and local CSOs express more confidence and willingness to seek official information: they submitted 34 information requests following the training.
- Correspondingly public officials appear to be more willing to honour these requests.
- There have been a number of proactive measures taken by local government authorities to improve their release of information and engagement with citizen feedback:
 - In Kamuli, they have established a rota to make use of a weekly two-hour radio program to share information with citizens and have initiated a grievance committee for citizens to bring any type of complaint, especially in terms of access to information. This helps to bridge some of the gaps between government processes in all their complexity and citizens' capacities and tolerance. The Communications Officer took the initiative of requesting copies of the Access to Information Act and shared them with all public officials in Kamuli. They also requested Twaweza's support in developing a communications strategy.
 - In six villages in Kole and Kamuli, local councillors organised community sensitisation meetings with citizens on access to information.
 - In Namutumba, the Assistant Resident District Commissioner directed that airtime allocated to government by local radio was used by local officials to educate the public about how to engage local government and their rights on access to information.
 - In Moyo, local officials committed to develop a manual to inform the public on what services are offered at their various offices. We will follow up on this commitment in 2023.
 - In Kole, local officials pledged to establish a register of information requests to enable easier tracking and to ensure requests are responded to on time.

The need for access to information training emerged from our own observations of implementing the animation process in 10 districts across Tanzania and Uganda. As we encounter increasing success and unblocking of challenges through this work, we also have begun to come across some of the natural limitations. In Mbogwe, government budgets could not keep up with the growing level of contributions from citizens meaning unfinished projects and risking a new erosion of trust. Some of

the issues raised across all the districts sit outside the mandate of district officials. In some cases, officials are deliberately obstructive and make it difficult for change agents or animators to do their work. In addition, our engagement with an organisation from Mtwara that had been working with animators, MSOAPO, and our own experience in Uganda especially, suggested that structural knowledge about systems and processes – where to influence, how budgets work, how to understand policies – was an essential tool for animators or change agents to influence significant change.

So we decided to begin with access to information. This resonated with earlier strands of work in marking Right to Know Day and working with the ministry to seek for amendments to the access to information law alongside extensive research into the topic. And change agents have significant information needs: to understand if commitments have been followed through, to seek answers to questions from community members, to formulate their demands to government meaningfully.

We worked with our partner the Africa Freedom of Information Centre to design and deliver tailored trainings on access to information for local officials and change agents and journalists in all the districts in which we were implementing the participation work. We held trainings in Kamuli, Kole, Namutumba and Moyo to reach 370 seekers or suppliers of information as follows:

- **Kamuli:** 46 national and local officials (33 male, 13 female), 65 journalists, local CSOs and change agents (47 male, 18 female)
- Kole: 44 national and local officials (32 male, 12 female), 54 journalists, local CSOs and change agents (29 male, 25 female)
- Moyo: 28 national and local officials (19 male, 9 female), 40 journalists, local CSOs and change agents (28 male, 12 female)
- Namutumba: 46 national and local officials (33 male, 13 female), 47 journalists, local CSOs and change agents (30 male, 17 female)

For each training, we were accompanied by high level officials from the ministry of ICT and national guidance which helped motivate attendance and attention and provided an important signal that the central government placed value on this work. In addition, in Kamuli, we were joined by the Minister of State for National Guidance who took the opportunity to formally launch and endorse our Access to Information Guide.

Each group was trained for a day, then received a follow up visit and refresher training for a further day followed by a program of digital mentoring. We were also accompanied by national level journalists to do stories on access to information issues. These journalists helped us to secure 20 pieces of coverage and five talk shows around our access to information trainings. And we are seeing nascent indications of a change in culture around seeking and supplying information.

However, we also observed genuine challenges in the law and a gap between the law and the accessibility of government information to citizens. Change agents were actively raising their hands to provide the types of information requests they wanted to make. One young woman explained *"They promised us a health centre 2. I want to know if they will build it."* The trainers and experts were momentarily stumped. The official from the ministry scrambled to recover: *"Well… firstly you can request to know if your area meets the criteria for getting a health centre 2. That shows whether they can meet their promise."*

The specifics of what information to request to address your problem, from what department or officials are complex. Citizens including change agents and journalists need support in translating their needs into government processes. As we move to roll out these trainings in Rubanda and Kyenjojo, we will explore including a support function on access to information requests in the

partners' responsibilities and ensure the partners have direct access to Africa Freedom of Information Centre who have vast expertise in this field.

Seeding a movement of active citizens: Tamasha la Waraghbishi (Animators' Festival) Tanzania

In 2022, we convened almost 150 Twaweza-supported animators from Kigoma, Maswa, Mbogwe, Pangani alongside 50 animators trained and supported by other organisations from Shinyanga, Mtwara, Lindi and Dar es Salaam. Over three days they shared stories in highly interactive sessions interspersed with singing and dancing.

And we see some early signs of connection and inspiration from the event. The animators who have access to smart phones (approximately 50) have continued to stay in touch and share experiences and stories via WhatsApp. In Pangani, the animators held their own version of the festival to share the experience with the citizens' committee members and others. The participating media are flying the flag of animation and engaging with animators to amplify their stories and experiences. The event also provided opportunity to introduce more civil society organisations and national media to the animation intervention as building blocks for future engagement to spread the ideas and methodology.

The idea for the festival originated early - as we were conceptualising the intervention - as a potential approach to strengthening the effects among the animators themselves and supporting them to exchange ideas and lessons and explore means to spread their work.

Initially, as we began implementing our citizen participation (or animation) intervention, we sought to establish proof of concept. Could we implement the steps as we had imagined them? Would we get buy in from local government under increasingly difficult contexts for democracy in Tanzania, and the shrinking of civic space in Uganda? Would we be able to catalyze a positive feedback loop between citizens and authorities to solve the lived problems as defined by citizens?

In many ways, the last few years of careful implementation and iteration have enabled us to give a confidently affirmative answer to these preliminary questions. Despite widespread scepticism among local government officials, many attempts to distort and influence the process, and an often weary and disillusioned citizenry, we are seeing the shoots of success taking root. Community members and officials are seeing the value of dialogue and engagement – statutory and other meetings are increasingly well attended with a broader representation especially in terms of gender. Transparency is becoming more of a norm as budgets and expenditures are shared and are more responsive to specific demands generated through Twaweza's participation work. And importantly services are being initiated and completed, roads are being constructed or fixed. And in both Tanzania and Uganda, communities are infused with new spirit – in Uganda to come together and contribute to build and serve and in Tanzania by articulating collective demand, as many officials relent and begin to appreciate the new dispensation.

So in 2022, we turned our attention in earnest to thinking about spreading and scaling animation. We have always sought to embrace the idea of expanding the effect and reach of the intervention through movement building. Change agents are bucking the trend in their own communities. They are committed, driven, resilient, persistent, community-focused. Their work is hard, sometimes thankless and always tough. It would be easy for them to default to community norms rather than always agitating for change; it is easy for them to become discouraged especially when faced with enmity, it is hard for them to find sources of ideas and inspiration.

In response to these challenges, Twaweza has supported joint reflective sessions between animators/change agents; we have facilitated exchange visits; and we have supported them to travel to neighbouring communities who are interested in learning more about the approach. In 2022, we further tried to amplify our efforts by convening *Tamasha la Waraghbishi* or the Animators' Festival in October in Tanzania.

The animators were thrilled to come together, to be acknowledged as a national force and to learn from each other's' experiences. They shared stories about obstructive government officials and the different means by which they had all worked around these individuals, and they discussed the interplay between animation and politics. They interfaced with a like-minded progressive reformer from Kenya and learnt some new mental health, self-care techniques as well as skills around value propositions, access to information and budgets and audits.

As Twaweza we planned the content carefully seeking to strike the right tone and form to inspire, engage and enable the animators in particular to learn from each other. We consulted and borrowed heavily from the Open Government Partnership's Learning Collaborative material and were able to tap into their network for resource people and speakers. We emphasised engagement with local media and invited representatives from local radios to join the festival and build relationships with the animators.

Moving forward, we are looking to explore a similar convening in Uganda but will need to grapple with challenges around language before we can do so.

Seeds of Sustainability? Participation beyond the contract Uganda

Over the past few years, we have been able to establish proof of concept in terms of the animation work. We have successfully implemented the approach and achieved some service delivery victories as well as some early indications of wider changes: inclusivity in public meetings, more transparency in local revenue and expenditure, and a more collaborative posture on the part of both local officials and citizens.

However, it is clear that there are specific contextual dynamics that play into this work and affect different elements of the process. However, the early seeds that seem to have been planted highlight the variation between different contexts, and how spreading this model will need to find a way to account for these divergences. In addition, we see some interesting and inspiring indications of the intervention lasting beyond its formal life. Communities feel the benefit of constructive engagement and follow up and want it to continue.

Beyond these preliminary indicatiosn of sustainability, over the past year, we have learned a number of lessons and gained a lot of insight on putting animation into practice. These insights have prompted a number of tweaks, adaptations and iterations in our methodology.

Based on feedback received during learning and reflection sessions with change agents and partners in Kamuli, Kole and Namutumba, we conducted a careful review of our training process. Participants felt over-loaded with the content, weary from the long duration of the training and insufficiently familiar with the tools provided. We reviewed the manual and the training process. We reduced the size of the training manual by a third and we refocused the physical training sessions on repetitive use of the most critical of these tools. We also created a complementary tool kit for change agents to guide them through their work in communities. The total length of the training was reduced from 10 to 7 days, and all training tools were translated into local languages for the new districts to support internalisation and application. These insights around the training process have also been applied in Tanzania.

The learning and reflection sessions also generated a lot of discussion around government engagement. A number of change agents had experienced push back from local officials when they approached them with limited information, insufficient evidence or poor knowledge of how government works. We know from anecdote and experience that this is a mechanism often used by people in government to deflect genuine concerns and issues away from themselves. Nonetheless, we also know that it is incumbent on us – as we seek to change the way government works – to be more aware of the right people and processes to pursue to address citizen priorities. So we introduced sessions on service delivery standards and the structure and function of different arms of local government. We also supported participants to explore stakeholder mapping to ensure they target the right officials who have influence and interest to address the issues raised by citizens. As a result of this increased knowledge among change agents and citizen follow up committees, we see, particularly in Namutumba, an improvement in the engagements between citizen representatives and local government. We are exploring opportunities to offer animators in Tanzania similar sessions.

Another major adaptation was around the community dialogues. Originally these were general discussions, held separately in every community, to engage with all the issues in that community. However, the monitoring reports and reflection sessions indicate that the issues across villages are similar and that the targets for action would be the relevant district office. Therefore we shifted to organising issue-based dialogues covering sectors and bringing together people from many villages to discuss and try to address all the issues raised around a given sector in the entire district.

This enables more comprehensive discussions and planning around each sector. Technocrats provide critical information on the standards, expectations, plans and budgets, and then together, citizens and local leaders chart a way forward with clear actions and expectations. The sector approach has also led to more holistic and widely beneficial solutions in some cases. For example, in Kole, two communities were recommended by their respective District Health Officers to have their health facilities upgraded during an issue-based dialogue, on the premise that land was available for the same. As a result, the two communities collectively agreed that this upgraded facility should be constructed in a third community that is a reasonable distance from both of them. One of the benefitting communities committed to grade and repair the access road to the health facility. Thus, resources have been used more efficiently to serve three communities and meet their expressed needs.

We will continue to regularly review and reflect on the components of the participation and animation work. At the same time, we are exploring two inter-linked questions: on how to spread or scale the work, and how to ensure its sustainability.

In Namutumba, we experienced fraud from a member of staff of the partner organisation. This has meant we have been unable to renew our engagement with Namutumba NGO Forum as we work with them to resolve the issues. However the change agents and citizen follow up committees have continued to follow up on the commitments made by local officials. We believe this is driven in part by the way in which Namutumba NGO Forum worked closely and consistently with change agents, holding their hands in the initial stages, especially with regards to who in government to follow up on different issues. This has built their confidence such that, even without the partner's support, they have continued to engage. In addition, the positive feedback loop seems to be in action in

Namutumba. A positive response from leaders motivates communities to continue to push for their issues to be addressed.

However in Kamuli, the end of the local partner's contract meant that the change agents and citizen follow up committees basically stopped following up on issues altogether. This may be because the environment in Kamuli appears to be generally more complex than some of the other districts in which we are working.

In Kole District, there were significant budget cuts from central government which has meant that the district has been forced to renege on some of the commitments made to the communities. However, local officials were honest with community members about how they have been forced to make these cuts. As a result, the community resolved to meet the gaps through community contributions. Although this cannot be a long-term solution - communities will experience fatigue – it is testament to the power of the ideas behind the participation work.

MISSION 2 – AMPLIFYING CITIZEN VOICES

Back with a bang: Sauti za Wananchi and the mobile money levy *Tanzania*

On 25 August 2022, almost exactly four years since the last Sauti za Wananchi launch, we were finally able to publicly launch new data, in front of an audience of almost 100 physical attendees, 50 online participants and thousands of livestream viewers. The launch was not without its pressures. During the event, our venue was surrounded by riot police sent to disband the launch. However, we stood our ground and sought some help from friends and collaborators such that the launch proceeded uninterrupted and the riot police left without taking any action.

The response to the data was overwhelming. The still active regime propagandists who came to the fore during the fifth phase administration took multiple measures to discredit us and share distorted versions of our data. The levels of mis- and dis-information were significant.

At the same time, we had opened a door for people to speak out about the levy. Despite declining to participate publicly in our event, a mobile network operator released their data a few days after our launch corroborating our findings on the decline in use of mobile money services following the introduction of the levy. Many other institutions and individuals reacted and responded with comments and even legal action against the levy. The cries against the levy were amplified. We received close to 50 pieces of traditional media coverage.

The government response was defensive at first, but eventually they shared information on the use of funds collected from the levy (Sauti data showed that knowing how it was spent made citizens express greater willingness to pay the levy) and, ultimately, on 1 October 2022, the levy was again revised downwards and abolished for certain transactions. We welcome the responsiveness of the Government of Tanzania to citizens' views on this matter.

This responsiveness and willingness to engage is not something we take for granted. Since 2018, Twaweza in Tanzania has been unable to launch and engage media around Sauti za Wananchi citizen survey data. We pursued the direct approach of seeking permission to publish under the previous version of the Statistics Act which required us to do so. This was refused. We pursued research clearance from the Commission for Science and Technology (COSTECH) in 2019, but to date we have not received a final response. And we more informally sense-checked different government institutions' appetite and willingness to engage with our data. But the context was such that we had accept year after year that the environment was not ready for citizen opinion polls.

However following the entry of the sixth phase administration and its more favorable rhetoric around democracy and civic space as well as some tangible institutional changes, we were ready to try again. As the first full year of the sixth phase regime, we decided that 2022 was the year to revive Sauti za Wananchi.

We collected data about people's perceptions of the economy as well as a new mobile money levy introduced in July 2021 to significant public outcry. We presented these data to the Ministry of Finance who also invited us to engage with a specialised tax task force at the Treasury and who committed to attending the public launch of these data. At the eleventh hour, however, the ministry requested that we provide a more balanced perspective on the mobile money levy by asking citizens their knowledge about and views on how the revenue collected from the mobile money levy was being used.

We obliged and generated a new data collection tool which we shared with the Ministry of Finance for review. When the data were collected, we sought to engage again with the Ministry to present the new findings and secure their participation in the launch. They again expressed willingness to engage.

However, government officials responsible for statistics began to express concern around the release of the data, citing the August 2022 census and several other issues as reasons to again postpone the launch. Since we were firmly on the right side of the law and given our willingness to add the data requested by the Ministry, we proceeded with the public launch event. We were keen to avoid a debilitating type of self-censorship which was palpable in civil society and led to organizations shying away from making comments or doing work that might elicit negative reactions from the government.

And so we launched citizen poll data for the first time in four years and achieved a range of important results and a strong affirmation of the positive value of citizens' voices in public debate.

And this was how Sauti za Wananchi came back with a bang!

A Tale of Two Cities: Engaging with the government in two counties *Kenya*

We contrast our experience of trying to engage with the process to develop a County Integrated Development Plan in two counties – Makueni and Nandi. Our experience in both counties was in some ways mixed. We were disappointed not to have been able to contribute at all in Nandi and to provide more substantive inputs in Makueni to support participatory County Integrated Developments Plans. We still have work to do to build strong relationships and trust between citizens, civil society and governments.

In Kenya, the process to generate County Integrated Development Plans that follows elections is a critical opportunity for Twaweza. In particular, we conducted - across 2020 and 2021 - qualitative deep dives in five counties on citizens' and civil servants' perspectives on and experiences of public participation processes. The complementary insight provided by these qualitative data, richer and more meaningful than those provided by our quantitative data, armed us with clear recommendations and calls to action to county officials working on these processes.

Yet we have struggled to find meaningful opportunities to push for engagement with and uptake of these findings. Through this process and as we have worked to entrench our initiatives, such as Sauti za Wananchi and participation, and the ideas behind them more broadly into government processes and practice, we have come to appreciate the centrality of moments of opportunity. Often, we can hope to influence a particular policy or practice, or even statement, but embedding the principles of citizen agency and voice into government systems is a much taller order. However there are specific processes or time periods during which government, driven by its own impetus, is likely to be more broadly receptive to our messages.

Our qualitative findings provided critical actionable insights on how to improve the public participation processes, such as those convened around the development of county plans.

- Citizens are more involved in planning than in implementation and efforts to engage them have mixed results
- Citizens and leaders generally have a specific definition of participation; this tends to imply consultations on planning in spaces into which citizens are invited rather than leading.
- Citizens articulate a number of logistical challenges in how consultations are organised: timing and venue details are shared late, there is limited outreach to encourage meeting attendance or to share topics being discussed, in the meetings bulky documents are shared in languages that citizens don't understand and with insufficient time offered for their review.
- Citizens see many of these consultations either as deliberate and outright manipulation or as rubber-stamping of prior decisions.
- Women and young people are often deliberately excluded.
- Citizens also behave cynically, attending meetings in expectation of payments but refusing to engage on substantive matters.

So we tried to engage two counties out of the five in which we had conducted the research.

In Makueni, we had long-standing relationships because, since 2019, we have been running Sauti za Makueni, a representative mobile public opinion poll. Since we have already won the trust of the county government, they saw as a 'safe' and reliable partner. We attended a number of CIDP preparation meetings and shared all of our briefs and data. This included a meeting convened by the Governor to map all actors who could support the county government during the CIDP process. We largely provided input on the topics of: youth, people with disabilities, livelihoods, land tenure, gender, and education. Subsequently, we were invited by the county to participate at a high-level convening to create their five-year strategic plan as well.

As a result of these engagements and our longer-term interventions in Makueni, we have received positive feedback from various parts of the county government. The planning department used Sauti za Makueni findings extensively in drafting their current CIDP that is under review. The findings have also been used to inform discussions in the County Assembly on land, livelihoods, Covid-19, gender and youth issues. The Department of Gender, Children, Youth, Sports and Social Services invited us to the launch of a new policy on Sexual and Gender-based Violence during which they acknowledged the use they had made of Sauti za Makueni data in formulating these policies. Finally, we were invited by the new Governor's team to provide some data in line with his manifesto. We are currently finalising a customised briefing paper on the same.

By way of contrast, our engagement with Nandi County has been more short-term and based on individual encounters for specific purposes in contrast to the in-depth relationship with Makueni County. Aside from conducting qualitative research there, we have supported officials from Nandi to attend OpenGov Week and present their action plan progress. We were deeply impressed by the

innovations described by county officials and the type of response from citizens. Therefore when we sought to expand our engagement with CIDP processes to more counties, Nandi was a natural candidate. They were behind schedule on production of the CIDP and welcomed our approach and offer.

In discussions with directors of two teams, we agreed an exciting program of support comprising financial support to suppliers of venues, refreshments and furniture for engagements with citizens, an ongoing radio program to invite citizens to engage more with the process and to share perspectives and information from the county, alongside documentation and feedback forms from the public engagements to enable learning and offer the county the opportunity to engage with the feedback that was not covered in the discussion through other means. In short out support was intended to re-invigorate the process and help build trust on the side of citizens.

Unfortunately, despite our mobilisation of resources and personnel in just a few days to meet the county's deadlines, we were prevented from doing any of this work including providing a financial contribution. The main concern on the part of the county seemed to be that we would use the experience to publicly paint them in a negative light. In response we wrote a letter informing the governor of what had transpired and we plan to try to re-engage Nandi County in 2023.

This experience taught us a few lessons:

- County officials are uncomfortable about communications with citizens and the possibility of being exposed through the media. This reinforces earlier lessons through our work on Uwezo that public engagement through media is a useful, albeit confrontational, tool to put pressure on government.
- As we have learned in Tanzania and Uganda, almost any government official who feels uncomfortable with our work can block it, despite higher-level buy in. We must always weigh the very real cost in staff time and resources needed to dislodge such bureaucratic resistance, against the sometimes less tangible value of the outcomes we seek (demonstrating transparency and participation).
- Intermediaries to help facilitate interactions between government and citizens can play a useful role in bringing the two sides together and starting to rebuild trust between them. We see this as a critical role for civil society to play. However, as evidenced by our experience in Nandi County, governments are reticent about, or even fearful of, allowing civil society organisations to play this role.

Amidst the fray: carving a space for evidence and partnership during the Kenyan elections *Kenya*

In Kenya, as all over East Africa, elections are moments of great hype: political analysts abound on street corners, passions are inflamed and tempers flare, and candidates clamour for the attention of the electorate who enjoy the once every five-year spectacle of feeling a sense of power. Amidst the myriad of actors and interests, it is a difficult space in which to make a dent and exert influence. However, as a promoter of democracy, we took up the challenge of engaging with the elections process in 2022.

We generated 32 pieces of media coverage around the elections, grew our social media following and were invited into new spaces and to engage with new potential collaborators. We successfully grew the Twaweza Kenya brand. In total, 359 people attended our election related events in person and virtually and we generated 361,200 impressions on social media through this work.

Most importantly, we established a strong and productive relationship with the IEBC at the technical level. The IEBC was keen to engage Twaweza to directly support their communication activities as a result of working with us. They requested support in creating a number of outputs. While we were unable to meet these requests given the short timeframe and lack of editorial independent offered, it is a testament to the value they saw in Twaweza as a partner.

Although we are not so naïve as to imagine we can make a dent on the overall political imperatives behind many of the electoral processes and institutions, we were able to influence the IEBC through our data. They used the data to inform their messaging and communications strategies. Between the first and second rounds of data collection, in part driven by our advice to them, we saw a significant increase in trust of the IEBC's work. Their willingness to engage and eagerness to respond to people's queries demonstrated openness in action.

To achieve these important milestones, we engaged the Independent Electoral and Boundaries Commission (IEBC) to co-create a number of call rounds. They highlighted topics or areas for which they wanted data and they reviewed all the data collection tools to ensure we were collecting information that was of use to them. We engaged extensively with them around the findings in advance of any public dissemination work. In these sessions we were able to take them through all the data collected and answer their questions, as well as provide advice on how they could respond publicly to some of the more challenging findings. As a result, the IEBC was represented at all Twaweza's public engagements and publicly and effusively acknowledged the utility of these data to their work as well as clarifying issues that the data highlighted and responding to any challenges raised in the data. Perhaps most importantly, we used all of the public engagement moments as opportunities to collect further questions and concerns from citizens on the IEBC's work and we encouraged them to respond to these.

In addition to the close interaction with the IEBC, we hosted public launches around the pre- and post-election data with the participation of dozens of key actors in elections. We engaged extensively on media and social media, including hosting a Tweet Chat on the elections, participating in interviews and sharing findings with journalists. We also used the People's Dialogue Festival as a dissemination platform for the data. We convened a civil society event, in collaboration with Mzalendo Trust, the Tax Justice Network – Kenya, the Organisation of African Youth and Chatham House. The aim was to share experiences and work that NGOs were doing around the election to explore opportunities for collaboration and complementarity. During this event the IEBC provided their reflections and updates on the process, as well as engaging constructively with questions and challenges from NGOs. Our partner, Uraia Trust, convened a high-level consultation of all actors working on elections and used our data to engage them.

Influencing the ways elections are conducted is challenging but we are proud to have been able to inject our evidence and ideas into a fraught space and be heard.

Let the people speak: Sauti za Wananchi influences debate and practice Uganda

In Uganda, Sauti za Wananchi exerts influence on a range of government institutions' work including the ministry of water, the ministry of health and the Office of the Prime Minister. We continue to influence these institutions as they seek to use our data. However, we are always keen to push ourselves and understand how to make our work add up to more. When it comes to Sauti za Wananchi, beyond the desire to influence specific policy actions, we seek to sow evidence into public debate and create public demand for research as well as spark people's intellects and imaginations to embrace new perspectives and insights; and we are propagating messages around

the value of citizen input more broadly in a bid to invite a more consultative, listening and responsive posture from a wider part of government.

In 2022, beyond our substantive program of media and government engagement around our data, we focused on sub-national engagements and expanding our connections with MPs. We made some inroads into these spaces. We conducted two sub-national events around our data which lead to close to 50 pieces of media coverage overall and engaged approximately 100 people at district level including officials from neighbouring districts. And we trialled the idea of convening MPs around specific issues raised by our data, in this case on the livelihoods crisis facing citizens. The follow up to this work is still ongoing.

To engage sub-national officials more meaningfully, Twaweza has increased the number of respondents in our second panel, so that we can provide regionally as well as nationally representative data. We believed that we could encourage local officials to be interested in data from citizens and create a groundswell of localised interest to complement the interest at national level.

So in 2022, we held our first sub-national Sauti za Wananchi launches. We produced national level briefs from the data but launched them in different districts outside of Kampala. However, since we were disseminating data that covered the region, we also facilitated the participation of Local Council Chairs from neighbouring districts.

In Arua, we released data around climate change issues given the significant impact in the region. In particular, we were pleased to secure the participation of Chief Administrative Officers and Environment Officers from Arua, Zombo, Maracha and Koboko. The discussion was energetic and prompted a lot of debate about what could be done in the region to look for alternative sources of energy rather than cutting down trees. Interestingly, the data also found that most Ugandans understand climate change to be driven almost exclusively by tree-cutting. A total of 29 people attended the launch and we secured 16 pieces of media coverage.

In Tororo, we launched data on taxation to an audience of 75 people. Again, Local Council V Chairs from surrounding districts were present. The discussion was engaging and went on for much longer than anticipated. During the event, the issue of money-lenders or loan sharks was raised by the LC V Chairperson of Namayingo who noted the lack of regulation in this sector and lamented that citizens were being forced by financial hardship to borrow money at extortionate rates of 10% per day and in some cases losing their homes as a result.

During the launch on taxation, we were joined by officials from the Uganda Revenue Authority who adopted a listening posture and genuinely tried to answer concerns as presented in the data and at the event.

We helped to awaken some appetite for poll data among local officials, we cemented a collegial relationship with URA who continue to be interested in seeking citizen feedback, and we ignited public conversation through our event and the media, with 27 pieces of coverage including 6 talk shows.

As a result of the discussions in Tororo, we also initiated some follow up work with the Centre for Policy Analysis (CEPA), to explore opportunities to bring the issue of money-lenders into national discussion to spark action by government to regulate this space and perhaps consider learning from Tanzania's relatively new municipal loans system. We seek to find solutions by challenges raised in our data or the discussions prompted by our findings. We pursued a similar approach around the current livelihoods crisis facing Ugandans. In July, as Parliament was debating the cost of living in the country, Twaweza and CEPA held a joint engagement with 14 MPs to share our most recent data on livelihoods, food stress and incomes. During the engagement, MPs encouraged us to share our findings with more of their colleagues and committed to injecting our findings into the ongoing parliamentary debate. We convened a follow up in October with 20 MPs who were also engaged by our findings and committed to share the data with colleagues.

By expanding our focus for dissemination of Sauti za Wananchi findings to local officials and placing more emphasis on reaching out to MPs, we are beginning a journey of taking our findings further. Specific issues highlighted in the data can be championed by MPs; they can help to advocate for solutions and support from government enabling Sauti za Wananchi to be able to contribute directly to finding solutions for the problems faced by citizens. In addition, the support for the data from local officials adds a new group of potential consumers of our data who also have some capacity to address some of the issues raised by citizens.

MISSION 3 – PROMOTING OPEN CIVIC SPACE

Nurturing digital-first, public interest media: a strategic partnership with The Chanzo Tanzania

Since 2021 we have been engaged in a strategic partnership with The Chanzo Initiative. After a comprehensive assessment of their operational, management and technical capacity we designed a program of support for them including the development of a new strategy, fundraising and M&E sessions, advice on finance and operations including supporting an accountant and the expansion of their network of correspondents.

Our support to them contributed to a significant growth in readership. Between November 2021 and 2022 the number of monthly visitors to their website has averaged between 30,000 and 40,000, compared to between 10,000 and 16,000 per month before June 2021. Between July and November 2022, The Chanzo attained 40,064 average visits per month with a September peak of 52,194 visits. The Chanzo audience on Facebook and Instagram has also increased, Facebook: from fewer than 2,000 to 26,000 followers, Instagram: 2,000 to 19,500 followers. Their reach on Facebook is at 4,406,532 users. In July 2021, The Chanzo had less than 10,000 followers on Twitter, but this has now increased to 41,900, with average monthly impressions at about 1,800,000. Between July and October 2022, The Chanzo has accumulated a total of 7.2 million impressions on Twitter with an average increase of 2,000 followers monthly.

They have also managed to work on their administrative and financial management capacity including implementing a number of Twaweza's recommendations from our initial capacity assessment.

But most importantly their journalism of courage and conviction has yielded meaningful outcomes:

• In April 2022, The Chanzo was the only media outlet to cover the misappropriation of funds from Dar es Salaam councils amounting to TZS 29 billion. As a result, officials were suspended and the case was referred to the anti-corruption agency.

- In Mtwara, work on electricity provision that had stalled for 15 months resumed within three days of their coverage of the story and Majengo village is now connected to the national grid.
- Content from The Chanzo also enabled workers from a private firm, SBC Tanzania, with the support of the government who were most likely informed by The Chanzo's coverage, to engage in talks with the company over improper dismissal over unionisation and abuse.
- The Chanzo helped prevent a forced eviction in Mbozi district and their coverage of missing youth in Zanzibar prompted investigation by the police that appears to have uncovered recruitment of young men for terrorism. A number of development partners are now planning to work in Zanzibar on this issue.

Twaweza's support to the Chanzo is built on both partners having shared values and objectives. We believe the platform can be an important part of our mission to demonstrate and spread citizen agency, to amplify citizen voices and to protect civic space.

Anecdotally, we believe The Chanzo is trusted. The outlet is owned, operated and managed by journalists. They focus on alternative angles, reframing issues and highlighting unheard voices. They offer a range of creative and compelling content types and formats. There is no doubt they are contributing to and generating informed public debate and with their growing reach and influence, we expect them to go from strength to strength.

The Chanzo focuses largely on authorities as an audience for their journalism so they can act on the issues raised as well as people to share information about their entitlements, of others' experiences and of critical events, and to provide a platform and space for their voices and issues. They follow up on issues raised by their stories and are already exerting influence, eliciting government response and onward sharing of their content by influencers including councillors.

The Chanzo straddles the fine line between journalism and activism, understanding journalism as a type of activism for accountability. They are part of a small stable of strategic partners: missionaligned organisations that we support to grow institutionally and achieve greater impact. We are proud to have been able to contribute to their success. Twaweza has a long history of varied engagements with the media from major strategic partnerships to multiple events and content dissemination activities. Despite the changing dynamics of the media landscape, there continues to be a critical role for media in accountability and development. Moving forward we will continue to explore the interplay between our participation work and media engagement, in particular as a means to consider cost-effective approaches to take our achievements to scale.

Protecting civic space: Legislative victories and disappointments in Tanzania *Tanzania*

Under the fifth phase administration in Tanzania, Twaweza developed a strong and active strand of work around legislative advocacy. With laws governing civic space being changed to become more regressive at every parliamentary sitting in great rafts of miscellaneous amendments, we became adept at responsive and agile advocacy. While reactive in nature it was essential for us to respond to some of the egregious changes being proposed. And against steep odds, we secured some victories including a) stalling the implementation of the online content regulations through an injunction, b) securing changes to the bill amending the political parties act, and c) removing two deeply restrictive clauses on the collection and dissemination of statistics.

As the sixth phase administration softened the rhetoric around democracy and civic space, we, along with many actors, waited for institutional and particularly legal change to back the words with

action. In 2022, we saw some early signs of a more democratic dispensation. Ultimately, the results were mixed: we saw two proposed legal amendments on which we were able to exert significant influence: the removal of a worrying clause granting undercover police immunity during their operations and the entirety of the amendments proposed to the COSTECH Act. At the same time, two bills were read in parliament that did not meet basic minimum democratic standards despite extensive advance engagements and inputs from civil society.

Early in the year, a series of amendments around the criminal justice sector were proposed. The need for criminal justice reform was in part brought to the fore through an open letter to the President from a staffer at the Legal and Human Rights Centre who had personal experience with the system. There were moments of excitement as partners and pro-democracy activists called each other wanting confirmation. We did confirm that the amendments were largely progressive, mediating some of the more extreme powers of parts of the criminal justice system. However, there was an amendment granting undercover police blanket impunity for any crime committed in the course of duty. We submitted a detailed analysis which was presented to the committee by our partners Legal and Human Rights Centre, alongside their own analysis. On 7 February 2022, the clause was withdrawn. The spiritual aspect of this victory cannot be understated: both that the amendments overall were broadly progressive and that the most problematic clause was withdrawn at parliamentary level after feedback from stakeholders.

In October 2022 however, this positive spirit was put more deeply to the test. Proposed amendments to the act that established The Commission for Science and Technology appeared to (re)introduce all the most problematic restrictions of the Statistics Act into the process for seeking ethical clearance for research. Twaweza convened 15 organisations and we submitted a detailed and compelling analysis. We also shared this among our networks including in government. We were informed that it was considered controversial even within government. On November 2, 2022 the amendments to the COSTECH Act were withdrawn entirely by government.

Despite these uplifting and important victories, the journey has not been entirely smooth. Engagement around two other laws provide a completely different experience. The Media Services Act has been a subject of particular stakeholder attention representing very restrictive approaches to a critical sector. And throughout the sixth phase administration, there has been the sense that the problems in this law were visible even to the people in power. Partners and collaborators of Twaweza held multiple engagements with the relevant ministry and reached the stage of agreement on many clauses. The indications were all positive, Twaweza partner, the Tanzania Editors' Forum even managed to secure the participation of the President in World Press Freedom Day celebrations. However when the amendments were finally brought to parliament, they were a great disappointment. The fundamental issues of licensing and registration of journalists alongside wide definitions of sedition have not been addressed. We will work with our partners including the Coalition on the Right to Information to push back against this betrayal.

Similarly, our partner JamiiForums has been engaging closely with the ministry of information on the issue of data protection and privacy. They engaged all the key stakeholders who generate data and developed a model bill. Ministry officials expressed deep gratitude for their support. When the proposed bill was finally tabled, stakeholders were shocked. The bill had no relationship to the feedback from key actors and seemed to attempt to create parallel rules and systems for government institutions collecting and holding people's data and non-government actors doing the same. The law has been enacted and we are working with interested partners to strategize our response. There is a possibility that regulations which will operationalize the law will re-incorporate the majority of the stakeholders recommendations.

The situation continues to be mixed. There are positive indications of intent and some successful follow through. At the same time the authorities' instinct for command and control remains strong. Moving forward, this presents a level of complexity for advocacy and creating narratives. We must respond to each structural issue as it arises. What we hear in the rhetoric about a more accommodating approach by government is not necessarily what we experience in practice.

United we Stand: Enhancing support to the civil society sector Tanzania

Under the fifth phase administration in Tanzania, with limited ability to truly influence government decisions and practice, Twaweza developed a complementary strand of work around civil society strengthening. Forged from the realisation that our profile as a leading civil society organisation could also be used to single us out, we invested resources and dedicated time into supporting the sector in terms of regulatory issues, we engaged substantively with the revitalisation of NACONGO and we became a key actor in the Civil Society Week. Despite the current improvements in rhetoric and action, we continue to believe that this strand of work is important to our broader vision.

In 2022, we built on previous engagements – in particular through being at the forefront of CSO Week and holding a smaller capacity exchange workshop for Northern Zone CSOs - but the outcomes seem to be mixed. On the one hand, some of our suspicions and the findings from our research with sub-national CSOs on training fatigue bore out: one participant claimed she had participated in more than 10 trainings offered by national NGOs and donors, and others were more keen to understand how they could partner with Twaweza financially.

But as the workshop proceeded, participants became more and more positive about the experience and the offer. Our brief survey showed that participants were engaged by the content and found the sessions useful; they all committed to applying what they had learnt and going back to share the content with colleagues in their organisations. They also all encouraged us to continue holding these types of workshops in other regions.

We were particularly gratified to see the level of engagement with the animation process both during the workshop and CSO Week. There is clearly substantial appetite among NGOs to take up this community-driven methodology that can enhance their effectiveness, legitimacy and impact. We were also able to use these fora to share data on citizens' interactions with and perceptions of NGOs. The data pose a significant challenge to NGOs as only 1 out of 10 citizens have ever interacted with (11%) or know of (14%) any NGO.

We were particularly active in CSO Week 2022: we pushed peers and colleagues to distinguish the event from the relatively new government-led NGO Form by having an outsize focus on citizens rather than government engagement. This mean reconceptualising the event, taking sessions away from conference halls into market places and public spaces. We also had to move away from sessions promoting our work and focus on our true value-added and offer to citizens. This reconceptualization of the nature of CSO Week generated real excitement amongst attendees and organisers. Removing the pressure to persuade government officials to attend enabled CSOs to dedicate their creativity and capacity to make a unique event. There was a mock trial session during the opening in which CSOs had to defend themselves against charges of failure to deliver and lack of legitimacy. Twaweza hosted a session on the future of Tanzania building from our scenarios work.

Twaweza also took on running all of the "clinic" sessions – skills exchanges for NGOs. At 7.30am every morning for four days in a row, we offered NGOs spaces for experience sharing and learning on media and advocacy, LME and research, community listening and participatory action research,

and the NGO Act. We also provided a legal booth for NGOs to visit to discuss their specific compliance challenges with our legal counsel. These sessions were always over-subscribed with standing room only despite the early start and demonstrated significant appetite among NGOs to improve their skills and do more effective work. Anecdotally we were widely acknowledged for our contribution to the event and in particular for our commitment to supporting our peers through the clinic sessions.

Building from this, and in response to demand from sub-national NGOs that we had engaged with during the review of the National Decentralisation Policy, and its associated implementation program, in 2019 and 2020, we also held a regional CSO capacity session for Northern CSOs immediately following CSO Week. We designed the content based on research we conducted among 56 NGOs to understand their capacity needs. Despite the proliferation of trainings offered by NGOs, we felt we could bring our unique signature to this space and support these sub-national organisations in their effectiveness and impact while also building a small network of collaborators for ourselves.

Moving forward we want to continue to build a community around animation: we see two important criteria that can help enable this approach. There are a number of veterans in the animation process: experts who have been working on this methodology for a long time and who are willing to work to propagate the methodology. We also see great interest to learn more and put animation into practice from almost every new organisation we introduce to it. We want to continue to raise challenging questions around NGO legitimacy and impact and help steward a reflective sector-wide conversation on our mandate and how we can build better connections with citizens as a way to enhance our resilience and sustainability – with animation as the bedrock.

Learning and Strategy

Learning: infusing our work with implementation insights

In the preceding sections of this annual report, we have captured the key lessons and insights from our implementation and programmatic monitoring in 2022. Below, we summarize the key learning and adaptation initiatives at Twaweza in 2022.

Annual retreat: What does it all add up to?

In November 2022, all Twaweza staff gathered in Dar es salaam, Tanzania for our annual retreat to reflect on our strategy, theory of change, context and progress so far. Since the year 2022 marked the penultimate year of our current strategy, we adopted the theme: what does it all add up to? That is, how much progress have we made towards our strategy goals and what are we learning as we approach the final year of the strategy. To conduct this broad reflection exercise, we used our five big bets, as articulated in our strategy and revised during our mid-strategy reflection process.

Big Bet 1: Action by animators, community representatives and local government champions will increase the ability, motivation and opportunities of citizens in selected geographies to participate in development decisions.

Generally, our implementation since 2019 reveal that citizens are actively participating in local decision-making including attending meetings and expressing voice, requesting for information, donating financially and providing labour for various community development projects. However, women and youth participation in development decisions remain low. We will redouble our efforts on gender and social inclusion in 2023 and beyond.

Big Bet 2: Through advocacy and communication, Twaweza and partners will demonstrate that citizen participation in local governance and service delivery lead to improved outcomes. Furthermore, these local experiences and insights will influence national conversations, media and policy.

Evidence from animation implementation as presented in this and previous annual reports confirm that citizen participation in decision making has resulted in improved social services particularly building infrastructures for health, water and education services. Following this successful demonstration, we need to become more deliberate about scale and spread. We codified the different potential approaches we are considering: inspiration – spreading stories and ideas to create a more supportive environment for any type of citizen agency and generating public debate on the same; integration – incorporating solutions identified to specific problems into policy, law or practice; replication – conducting the same intervention directly or in partnership with other CSOs; components – separating out key elements of the process that we think are part of the 'secret sauce' for success and incorporating them into other sectors and interventions.

Big Bet 3: Provision of contextualized, systematic and regularly collected voices will compel public officials to engage citizens more in discharging their mandates (be more responsive to citizens' priorities)

Over the past four years, our Sauti za Wananchi initiative in all three countries (despite limited rounds in Tanzania) and other citizen voices initiatives have influenced important decisions and actions by government officials at the national and sub-national levels. These are summarized elsewhere in this and previous annual reports. In 2023 we need to explore how this can contribute to a broader attitudinal and norm shift around the value of citizen input rather than a series of one-off victories.

Big Bet 4: Early [government] adopters of citizens' voices and participation will be encouraged, and will encourage their peers, to spread ideas and practices through early, even smaller successes. The positive outcomes will re-enforce and entrench these attitudes and behaviours helping to start a shift in norms among their peer group.

While we are happy with the promises and initial action taken by early adopters as summarized in this and previous annual reports, we are yet to see them spreading ideas and practices to their peers. But we do find that referrals and endorsements between government institutions help us advance our agenda more efficiently. Moving forward, we need to explore whether we can systematically influence these referrals and, more importantly, contribute to discourse between key actors about citizen agency and voice.

Big Bet 5: The confluence of diverse actors protecting and promoting democratic values within their spheres of influence compels Government to soften/tone down restrictive measures. We have recorded mixed results under this big bet. We have successfully mobilized diverse actors to co-design and undertake joint analysis and engagement on various legal reform bills in Tanzania and we have contributed to the growth and development of key allies in civil society. We are exploring whether our field-building needs to become a strand of work in its own right and how we can concertedly act on a specific element of civic space over time even though these issues overall are subject to a range of forces that are stronger and more compelling than Twaweza's influence.

Animation studies in Tanzania and Uganda

Implementation of the animation program in Tanzania and Uganda is at different stages in different locations. In summary, in 2022, we introduced that program in 2 districts in Uganda and one district in Tanzania following intensive scoping studies, we conducted midline assessments in Maswa and Pangani districts in Tanzania and conducted endline evaluations in Kigoma-Ujiji and Mbogwe districts in Tanzania.

In April and May 2022, we successfully conducted scoping visits to three districts in Tanzania and three districts in Uganda and subsequently selected one district in Tanzania (Mtama) and two districts in Uganda (Rubanda and Kyenjojo) for implementation. We also conducted baseline studies in each of these districts comprising of about 1800 household surveys (about 600 per district), about 180 focus group discussions and over 150 key informant interviews.

Between August and October we conducted midline evaluation in Maswa and Pangani districts to assess implementation progress of the animation process. A significant insights was that the large number of villages selected for implementation was putting too much pressure on our partners. We have decided to proceed with 10 villages per district, instead of the originally planned 18, to address this.

And in August and September we conducted endline evaluations in Mbogwe and Kigoma-Ujiji. In Mbogwe our implementing partner (MBODANET) struggled with serious leadership and accountability challenges while in Kigoma, political interference forced us to disengage for about two years. The endline evaluations informed our decision to keep working in these two areas and to invest more in supporting animator networks and local partners with financial sustainability and viability.

KiuFunza: getting ready to go big and go government! Tanzania

The core idea of KiuFunza is that the motivation and effort of teachers in the lowest grades should be supported to improve basic student skills: reading, numeracy, and writing. Whereas currently practically all state and non-state resources in education pay for inputs - buildings, teacher training, fixed salaries. KiuFunza pays for outputs by linking teacher rewards to independently measured student learning outcomes.

Randomised evaluations of KiuFunza consistently show that our performance incentives result in large learning improvements, at a comparatively low cost. In addition, our impact evidence shows that the performance incentives inspire teachers to focus on learning for all their students, regardless of their initial level and despite the severe crowding in these classrooms.

In 2022, KiuFunza was in a completion and preparation phase. We paid teachers for their performance in 2021 in the first quarter. In 2021, learning effects were particularly large. A randomised evaluation of the most recent KiuFunza intervention (summarized <u>here</u>) shows that the effect sizes range between 0.24 and 0.44 Standard Deviations (SDs), a common metric to compare effects. To put this in perspective, a comprehensive recent review of RCT studies of learning effects in education interventions finds that 50 percent of effects are 0.10 SD or below; 75 percent of effects found are 0.23 SD or below; and 90 percent of effects are at 0.45 SD or below. In other words, the recent KiuFunza effect estimates are among the 25 percent largest effects in this literature.

We held a large event in Dodoma with the Minister of Education and regional and district officials present to award the best performing teachers per region. This was also part of our policy engagement which will be picking up momentum in 2023 as we seek to integrate KiuFunza more formally into government systems and tactics either at local or national level.

We built on this event to seek feedback on our proposals for the design of the fourth phase of KiuFunza in Dodoma and also organised a design workshop with all our partners, government and the Hempel Foundation.

Over the period 2023 - 2026, KiuFunza will target 265 of the poorest performing public primary schools in Tanzania, in the ten regions with the lowest performance in terms of national assessments. Within these schools, KiuFunza will incentivise teachers in the three lowest grades, where fundamental skills are taught.

We have made a number of design changes over time to increase the efficacy and effect of the intervention. For KiuFunza 4, we have dropped the written tests as they created difficulties in efficient grading and we have introduced improvements in the data system such that implementers can now check their progress as they work, with the aim of reducing errors.

We are looking forward to, at the start of 2023, launching KiuFunza 4 and supporting genuine learning improvements for some of the country's most disadvantaged pupils while, at the same time, working to influence government to take up the idea of teacher pay for performance in earnest.

Operations, Finance, Governance and Management

Operations: keeping the cogs oiled

We continued our high standards of operational management through our human resources and administration functions. The Operations Unit are the custodians of Twaweza policies and procedures and ensure that we are able to deliver our work efficiently and to the highest ethical standards.

In 2022, we developed and began implementation of a detailed procurement policy. We also began the development of five further policies based on feedback from the internal audit.

We ramped up our internship program with 12 interns recruited, five of them were women. We recruited our first person with disabilities for an internship and this has helped Twaweza staff embrace the value of inclusion more practically.

Staff motivation continues to be high and is supported by regular team-building activities.

We procured over 100 assets for the organisation including a car for field travel after we conducted a careful cost benefit analysis based on two years of transport expenditure.

In 2023, we look forward to the finalisation of a number of key policies informed by our selfassessment through the internal audit and to continuing to maintain our strong performance in ensuring the organisation runs smoothly.

Finance: running an exemplary ship

In 2022 we continued to maintain strong financial systems and complied with our tax and other statutory obligations. We were subject to six audits: our statutory audit by Deloitte, an Efficiency Audit by KPMG, the Internal Audit by Innovex, Uganda Audit by HLB, a Tax Review by Uganda Revenue Authority, and the continuation of the 2021 Tax Audit by Tanzania Revenue Authority. All

of these resulted in no or minimal audit findings. Some of our partners recognise the strength of Twaweza's financial management systems and ask for support, guidance and mentorship to improve their own systems.

In February 2022, the influential publication - Chronicle of Philanthropy - published a case study of Twaweza's unique basket funding approach as a model for others to emulate. The study aimed at developing a series of recommendations and interventions to address insufficient cost coverage in project grants. This has elevated Twaweza's global profile in the field of good financial management practices.

In 2022 we were awarded the National Board of Accountants and Auditors (NBAA) prize for the second best presented financial statements among NGOs for the second year running.

In 2023, we look forward to maintaining our strong track record.

Governance: navigating a dynamic context

The civic space context in all three countries in which we operate continues to be volatile. There has been a softening of rhetoric and initiation of some important institutional changes in Tanzania. Perhaps most importantly, the administration is much more open to engaging with civil society across the spectrum from NGOs to media to political parties. In Uganda there have been a number of new regulatory controls introduced and actions taken against CSOs, including the overnight suspension of over 50 NGOs, the enactment of new legislation on data protection and NGO operations among others. Kenya's civic space environment, while markedly more open than Tanzania and Uganda, was subject to highly charged elections.

Financially, we were not immune to the economic tightening hitting countries and sectors across the world. One of our grants was cut and we have seen the end of a number of bilateral funding streams. Nonetheless we continued to be well supported by our core partners: the Hewlett foundation, SIDA Tanzania, The Swiss Agency for Cooperation and Development (SDC) through the Swiss Embassy Tanzania, Ford Foundation, Wellspring Philanthropic Fund and Hempel Foundation. We continue to exert efforts to bring new funders on board. We also featured as the only case study in a study of 81 civil society organisations from around the world examining the effect on sustainability of funder practices.

Our work in the Open Government Partnership allows us to bring practical and granular experience, the work of claiming accountability and encouraging participation and voice, to international spaces and to the, often, theoretical conversations about these issues there. The Executive Director's Co-Chairship of the initiative was extended twice to oversee the strategy review process which involved multiple regional and global consultations. The Executive Director also continued to serve on the board of the Global Partnership for Sustainable Development Data (GPSDD).

We also convened and hosted the Imagine Tanzania in 2050 scenarios workshops to co-create stories of potential futures for Tanzania with a diverse and exciting group of influential and progressive individuals from civil society, politics, business, media and culture. In 2023, we will use the stories developed to engage and influence government, citizens and civil society.

We will also be stewarding the development of a new strategy and seeking to bring new funding partners on board.

ANNUAL REPORT 2022: Part 2 – Progress on Outcomes

ANNUAL REPORT 2022

PART TWO

Progress towards our strategic goals and strategic outcomes

Corresponding to the two related problems we want to contribute in addressing as guided by our threepart mission statement, we articulate three broad strategic goals to be achieved by the end of the strategic period in 2023. Each year, we have been making some progress towards these three goals:

- 1. Citizens have the ability, willingness and opportunity to articulate their problems, come together to discuss them, express their views in the public sphere and take civic action to address these challenges. They are acting, organising for change, and they use multiple strategies to do so.
- 2. Local and national government agencies operate in ways that take account of citizen concerns, voices and civic action, and are able and driven to act in response.
- 3. Civic space is less restricted in regard to basic respect for free expression, association and assembly; access to information; and established rule of law.

To achieve our strategic goals, we have articulated over twenty strategic outcomes. Across all our interventions, we are working to achieve outcomes first at the level of specific targeted actors, and then at a wider societal level. These outcomes inform and help us to assess our direction of travel, what we think the described activities are achieving, and what we think is required to make some progress in terms of our wider ambitions and vision.

We can recount many examples of **citizen agency** contributing to tangibly improve public service delivery in the locations where we work, of **citizens' voices** leading to changes in policy and practice. And we have had some success in **pushing back against closing civic space** and strengthening civil society.

However, as we move into the last year of our strategy, we seek better understand the scale and scope of these achievements: have we merely generated a number of one-off successes? Or have we contributed to wider systematic change?

Actor Outcomes

1. Actors: Local Change Agents in selected geographic areas (10 districts in two countries)

By local change agents, we mean community members with a spirit of service, well-regarded in the community and imbued with the desire to imagine the world anew. We tend towards young people and pay attention to gender in selecting these local change agents to be community animators in our interventions. They are tooled with skills dependent on their roles and responsibilities but with a focus on facilitation, consensus-building and listening. For our core animation interventions, we work with

animators – two per community – and people's committees – six to ten elected community members per village.

The animation approach involves the use of participatory action research (PAR) facilitated by the local change agents to unearth the underlying community problems and develop action plans to guide the actions and interactions of citizens and their local authorities in addressing those problems. Since 2019, we have introduced this animation approach in five districts in Uganda (Kole, Kamuli, Namutumba, Kyenjojo and Rubanda) and five districts in Tanzania (Mbogwe, Kigoma Ujiji, Pangani, Maswa and Mtama). While implementation is at different stages across the 10 districts, we summarize below what we accomplished in 2022.

<u>Tanzania:</u>

At the start of 2022, the animators and citizen follow up committees in Mbogwe, Pangani and Maswa were supported to reflect and share experiences, participate in a refresher training and receive handson mentoring sessions and midline studies. They continued to support their communities to implement commitments in action plans. We held four reflection sessions in Tanzania.

In Maswa and Mbogwe, the partners trained the citizen follow up committees in the basics of animation so they could be more actively engaged in the process. In addition, they supported peer learning in the form of exchange visits among the change agents and the citizen follow up committees from villages that had registered slow progress and those that were performing very well.

In Pangani, we increased the number of villages covered by the film for development intervention from three to ten, produced and screened seven episodes of the 24-minute film across the 10 intervention villages to kickstart conversations and reflection in the communities on problems that require collective efforts to solve. We brought on board a new district, Mtama in Lindi Region in the south and by the close of the year we had completed the recruitment of an implementing partner, Lindi Assocation of NGOs (LANGO).

In September, we organized the Animators' Festival borrowing from content by key figures in the Open Government Partnership's Leadership Collaborative. We invited animators from all the five districts and other districts and regions where other CSOs have implemented the animation approach for many years – we convened a total of 196 animators. To have greater impact, we focused heavily on structuring participatory sessions during which animators could learn from each other and have open discussions about their real challenges and questions.

<u>Uganda:</u>

We introduced the animation work in two new districts; we under took scoping studies, recruited implementing partners and trained them using a more refined animation process after incorporating lessons from reflection and refresher trainings in the initial three districts. This refined animation approach has improved mastery of the skills and the speed of implementation. In Kole, the change agents integrated Village Saving and Loans Association into the community meetings which caused an increase in attendance.

Change agents in Namutumba and Kamuli continued to follow up commitments made by their leaders to solve priority concerns of their communities. For example, after two failed attempts to drill high yielding boreholes, the District Water Officer in Kamuli provided the community with new information that this was because of the hard rocky catena and that the district was planning to install a piped water

system at Kiige Parish in Kagumba Sub County which would resolve concerns in Busongole and Bwase villages. In addition, citizen follow up committees together with the change agents were trained by the partner on how the local government structure works and service delivery standards. We held a total of 6 training sessions with 212 participants. We also supported mentoring sessions for change agents in Kamuli which were attended by the citizen follow up committees which improved the working relationships between the two.

Outcomes

Animators and people's representatives mobilise citizen accountability actions and participation, and problem-solving

Tanzania

In Maswa district, the construction of three health centers that had stalled for over five years was revived. New market areas were allocated and now communities are selling and buying goods in two villages. A cow dipping area was revived after many years of not working.

In terms of governance in Maswa, misunderstandings between citizens and leaders were resolved and citizens are now attending meetings in greater numbers. In Matalambuli village, income and expenditure reports that had not been shared in village meetings since 2017 are now being presented. Local authorities are no longer using informal security groups to arrest citizens who do not contribute to development projects - communities are contributing of their own volition. The change agents and citizen follow up committees pressed their local MP to honour his commitment to provide iron sheets for a local project.

In Mbogwe, concerns in two villages about people being forced to be vaccinated first for COVID-19 before being given other medical services and other customer care problems were addressed by hospital level management personnel. In two schools classrooms were constructed and in a further four schools, new toilets were constructed. Five new roads were opened in Mbogwe, improving mobility across communities. After citizens expressed concerns about teenage pregnancies in their communities, a number of information and awareness campaigns were run.

In terms of governance processes in Mbogwe, village budget and expenditure reports are being read in all except one village (20), and overall attendance to these meetings has increased.

In Pangani, Mkwaja Primary School ranked top in Form 4 results due to the school meals program agreed upon by communities. A pre-school classroom was being constructed as a result of animation meetings. Security around people's properties was improved after successful engagement and collaboration with local police. Pregnancy among school girls, which was a major challenge in the area, appears to have decreased and the adult man who impregnated a student was jailed following efforts from animators.

In summary, we are seeing the resumption of stalled construction projects and the revival of community level accountability fora where budgets and expenditure are shared. We also see improved relationships between citizens and local leaders on both sides as communities willingly contribute to projects and as leaders respond actively to community problems and concerns.

Overall, in Tanzania, a total of 152 issues were included in the action plans in three districts; of these, 61% or 93 issues were solved (Maswa 23/54, Mbogwe 23/44, and Pangani 46/54).

A total of 143 community meetings were organized in 43 villages in the five districts during 2022. Of these, 55 (38%) were exclusively convened on animation work and 88 (62%) were regular village meetings that touched on priorities contained in the animation action plans. A total of 17,799 citizens participated in these meetings of which 10,335 (58%) were men and 7,464 (42%) were women.

Uganda

Change agents and citizen follow up committees consolidated the delivery of solutions to community priority problems. Pledges made between 2020 -2021 were followed up throughout the year. As a result numerous service delivery challenges were solved. In Uganda, a total of 147 issues were included in the action plans; 45 issues or 31% have been resolved (Namutumba 21/36, Kamuli 10/34, Kole 10/36, Rubanda 4/33, Kyenjojo 0/8). Additionally, there are 28 issues that have been partially resolved (Namutumba 8, Kamuli 6, and Kole 14).

Improved access to water: The animation process resulted in the construction of 7 boreholes (4 in Namutumba, 2 in Kamuli, 1 in Kole), 10 other water sources, largely shallow or hand dug wells (5 in Namutumba, 1 in Kamuli), and 1 underground tank and 2 mini solar systems for piped water. In Kamuli, drilling commenced for 3 further boreholes but could not be completed because of hard rock and low yield in the area. In response to this challenge, the district has incorporated the provision of piped water systems in the area into the 2023/4 budget following these failed attempts to provide boreholes.

Better roads: Two community roads in Namutumba were graded and their culverts fixed. In Kole, one road that reduced the time for people from Adagani to travel to the major health facility for the area in Owekrodot was repaired. And in Kamuli, three roads in Busuuyi, Busongole and Bubaale were rehabilitated.

School infrastructure: In Kamuli, two new classroom blocks were constructed by the government at Butaaga Primary School and a second pit latrine was built by the community in Butaaga Village.

A total of 7,900 people (3,717 males and 4,183 females) were involved in participatory action research meetings including engagements with three Members of Parliament (2 in Namutumba, 1 in Kole)

Overall, we observe an improvement in the ability of the community to negotiate and engage with their leaders. The improved trust between government and citizens also supports the identification and implementation of more efficient and effective solutions. An example comes from Adagani and Amiabil villages which both prioritised the allocation of a Health Centre III in their communities but, after discussion, agreed to share one facility in a central location (outside of both communities). In Adagani budget was instead allocated to improving the road that will take community members to this new health facility. Similarly, in Kamuli the successful renegotiation of funds for boreholes into solar systems for piped water took place after the original solution of new borehole construction was shown to be challenging. Makwi Village in Namutumba is a model animation village: change agents successfully demonstrated their ability to make demands, push for change, and follow up on budget execution until commitments on roads and water were delivered.

Animators and people's representatives request public information and engage in local government processes

Tanzania

Animators and citizen follow up committees visited local government officials 258 times (village/street level officials 176 times and ward officials, 82 times) and managed to have a total of 143 meetings with local government officials in the course of implementing and following up priorities and action plans. Follow up visits at the village level total 176 - Maswa 73, Pangani 62, and Mbogwe 51 Follow up visit at the ward level – Pangani 34, Maswa 33, and Mbogwe 15

Some 29 meeting minutes (deliberations) and 21 letters were submitted by animators to various local government offices including ward offices, district level offices such as TANESCO, TARURA, TAKUKURU, and a district water and sewage authority.

Uganda

Some 20 animators made information requests and these were responded to.

In addition, 24 meetings were held, including: 1 district dialogue, 6 sub county dialogues, 6 issue based dialogues and 12 village dialogues. Participants included public officials (Community Development Officers, District Health Officers, District Water Officers, and District Planning Officers, and at the sub county level, there were Parish Chiefs, Senior Assistant Secretaries (Sub County Chiefs), Councilors, Speakers, health centre leaders, head teachers), from across the spectrum of local government and representatives of NGOs working in the sub counties of intervention.

What we are learning

We are seeding a movement of active citizens. The animators' festival in Tanzania was an opportunity for change agents to refresh, re-energise and experience a sense of community with like-minded people from across different parts of the country. There was a deep sense of connection, regardless of social position in their community or education levels and useful networks were established. Most importantly, the festival provided an opportunity for all animators to share their experiences, be vulnerable and seek communion with their peers. What we learnt from the three-day event is that, at regular intervals, animators need to come together to celebrate their existence and achievements. This re-energises them and strengthens their own sense of themselves as a social movement and belonging to a cause. Most importantly they were able to access resources that they could not tap into in their own communities.

We need to be prepared for push back. Despite our best efforts at full bureaucratic compliance and to engage a range of district officials and political leaders in the animation process, conflicts do arise. In Pangani, the local change agents and citizen follow up committee members were even taken to court. This was amicably resolved in the end but it is an important reminder that our collaborative approaches and efforts cannot conceal that some of this work may challenge entrenched power structures that will fight back.

The assumption that young people are more active and will sustain animation work needs to be qualified. Our young change agents move around a lot - especially in Kamuli and Namutumba. We are

then forced to replace the change agents and provide on-the-job training, which is less than ideal. In Kole on the other hand, the change agents are mature but have managed to move further and faster than their peers: they have registered a network, and held two peer learning and support meetings that they initiated themselves.

We are learning how to managing expectations while maintaining motivation. Realising results based on the action plans is a daunting task for citizen follow up committees and change agents as communities tend to have high expectations for immediate results. We have introduced a number of elements to the process to try to address these challenges. Both in Uganda and Tanzania, we organised peer learning, whereby change agents or animators and citizen follow up committees who are struggling to secure audiences with local government officials visit those who are making better progress. This has helped motivate those who were feeling discouraged by their lack of progress. In addition, partner program officers in Tanzania and Uganda supported the animation training for new districts which served as an acknowledgement of their expertise and capacity and also helped to motivate them further. We also, directly and through partners, encouraged and supported closer and more regular contact with and between change agents and citizen follow up committees which prompted them to keep closer track of local events to ensure they do not miss any opportunities for engagement including budget conferences, council meetings, consultative meetings.

2. Actors: MPs, District Executive Directors and village government (in selected geographic areas)

Our strategy aims to unblock factors that constrain effective governance on both the demand side (citizens) and supply side (government). As a result, we proactively engage Local Government authorities at the Village (LC1 in Uganda), Ward (Sub-County in Uganda) and District level, and people's political representatives such as Members of Parliament and Councilors.

In 2022, local change agents, citizens' follow up committees and village leaders engaged in productive discussions through, face to face meetings, submissions of petitions or request letters, invitations to leaders to attend issue-based dialogues and sector meeting. These created opportunities for dialogue, negotiation and collectively reaching a shared position towards solving the community priority needs.

Through these engagements, public officials provided information to community members, which addressed misinformation, but also strengthened community bargaining power as well as easing the pressure on the leaders when and where they were compelled to withdraw their commitments because of significant budget cuts, especially in Uganda. In Tanzania, the local government authorities demonstrated greater openness to the animators by inviting them to their meetings. Below we summarize the outcomes achieved and lessons from the various engagements with MPs and local government officials.

Outcomes

MPs, councilors and local government officials participate in, endorse and institutionalize Twaweza / partner citizen agency processes and evidence collected

Tanzania

Animators received 53 responses from various local government and district level officials responding to various request from animation. Most of the responses provided were verbal through meetings and phone calls.

Animators received 19 invitations to attend village council meetings and 9 invitations from institutions such as schools and nearby villages to share and support them with their animation experience.

57 animation community action plan priority activities were escalated as follows: 34 activities adopted in village government plans, 17 activities were adopted to Ward Development Councils and 6 priorities were presented to the full District Council. We will follow up in 2023 with district officials to understand if these priorities have been acted on.

Uganda

Uganda Revenue Authority officials attended the launch of Sauti za Wananchi data on citizens' perceptions of taxes in Tororo and responded directly to the concerns raised by citizens. Local government officials in Tororo and Arua appreciated the Sauti za Wananchi briefs on taxation and climate change respectively and asked that these should also be shared in other regions to help Ugandans dialogue with the authorities.

Overall, 18 planning and budgeting meeting were attended by change agents, citizen follow up committee members and partner staff including technical planning committees, sector meetings, budget conferences and council meetings.

In Kamuli, 9 official meetings (5 sub county councils and 5 budget conferences) at sub county levels were attended by 13 (7 male, 6 female) change agents, and 12 (6 male and 6 female) citizen follow up committee members, while 2 staff from the partner organization attended a sub county technical planning meeting and a district education department meeting.

In Kole, 7 official planning meetings (6 sub county budget conferences and a district conference) were attended by 24 change agents while the partner staff attended the district budget conference. However, partner staff attending budget conferences meant that the change agents themselves did not get the opportunity to speak out on behalf of their communities.

In Rubanda by the end of the year, two meetings - one sub county engagement and one district budget conference - were attended by one male change agent at the sub county and the district conference was attended by the partner.

We harnessed the power of MPs and helped to breathe life into existing accountability mechanisms as two MPs acted on the concerns raised by their communities. The MP for Busiki North Constituency in Namutumba contributed materials towards construction of the maternity ward, amplified the challenges of community members in Kakunyu village, and presented the issue of inadequate access to health services in Parliament calling for the Irimbi Health Centre II to be upgraded to a Health Centre III. Similarly, the Member of Parliament representing Bugabula South is continuing to work on his pledge to support and lobby for the establishment of a technical college in his constituency to absorb the many young people dropping out of school. This concern was raised by members of Bulinda village, in Kamuli.

MPs, councilors and local government officials escalate and/or respond to citizens' voices and challenges, entrench them in decision-making

Kenya

Through continuous engagement with the technical team in Makueni County, offering them the opportunity to propose indicators on any of our topics, sharing tools for them to review and sharing all the findings with the relevant sectoral teams, we established a strong relationship with the county government. As a result, the new incoming Senator and Governor are keen on exploring a partnership with Twaweza.

The manifesto for the new Makueni Governor was informed by Sauti za Wananchi data. The data will also act as a baseline for monitoring for the new administration in the county.

A total of five Women Members of the National Assembly (Women Representatives) and two Senatorial Candidates attended the #Tusemezane public debate. They made commitments both in response to the Sauti za Makueni data as well as to the questions that were raised by the citizens. The debate received coverage from over 10 media houses including more than three pieces of live coverage on the local dialect TV and radio stations supporting the pressure for responsiveness generated by the debate. Makueni County Government invited Twaweza - as a key partner in Makueni - in public participation fora with other key stakeholders to share their views on the proposed budget for the year 2022/2023.

On numerous occasions, Twaweza was invited to participate in the public consultations on the County Integrated Development Plans for different sectors by the Makueni County government.

Tanzania

Through our #MbungeLive radio programs, MPs are engaging more on media with citizens' problems in eight constituencies. They are regularly featured on radio programs, responding to challenges raised by citizens. Although we are conducting a fuller evaluation in early 2023, anecdotes from the journalists suggest that they are able to access MPs to respond to citizen concerns more easily (initially, before the intervention of our partner Maa Media, they were often unable to secure interviews with MPs at all). Our own review of the programs indicates that journalists are making more effort to collect citizens' concerns and share them with the MP.

Uganda

MPs requested a wider engagement with their colleagues around our Sauti za Wananchi livelihoods data. They committed to raise the issue of the livelihoods challenges faced by citizens in Parliament. As a follow up, we held a virtual meeting which brought together 20 MPs who committed to use the findings from Sauti za Wananchi to inform their deliberations in committees and in Parliament.

With support from Center for Policy Analysis, we organized a press briefing on the state of Youth in Uganda at Parliament in partnership with the Youth Parliamentary forum.

Hon. Ronald Kanyike - Bukoto East MP at the thirty third sitting of the first meeting of the second session of the eleventh parliament raised Sauti za Wananchi data on taxation and the business environment on the floor of parliament.

Hon. Kayogera Yona presented issues of inadequate health services on the floor of parliament using the feedback of the change agents from his constituency in Namutumba district.

What we are learning

Our hunch around the power of progressive insiders to advance change, seems to be bearing out. The referral from the Ministry of Finance to the Uganda Revenue Authority (URA) was an important entry point and helped facilitate make the rest of the collaboration. Once URA felt a sense of ownership over the findings they were active in engaging with the insights and responding to feedback. Our critical feedback exercise will provide some indications of whether they have absorbed any wider sense of the value of citizen feedback. We have seen similar dynamics, whereby the endorsement of the national ministry unlocked a more positive reception from local government officials in Uganda through the Access to Information trainings. However, both of these instances of government officials 'infecting' other government officials are more hierarchical – from a presiding institution to subordinates. In terms of peer-to-peer engagement, the LC V Chair in Kamuli shared the value of access to information and some elements of the training received to his peers in surrounding districts.

Productive citizen – local government engagement can be usefully unlocked by local intermediaries.

The animation work and #MbungeLive bear this out. In Maswa, some animators use their link to Twaweza as a means to demand accountability from local government officials. The animators themselves in all cases act as intermediaries, pushing for accountability to commitments on citizen priorities among both community members and local officials but also being put to work by local officials for their own agendas - engaging the animators makes mobilising the community easier for local officials. Through #MbungeLive the national production partner has been able to convince sometimes reluctant MPs to respond to local radio requests. These examples support the broader idea of the need for intermediary support in pushing for responsiveness and accountability from public officials.

We (and other CSOs) can play an important role connecting national and sub-national actors. Local radio stations often struggled to access their MP. Through the intervention of our national production and training partner who has good linkages with MPs, we were able to support them through this obstacle. This throws into sharp relief the type of synergy and impact that can happen through building linkages between sub-national and national entities. National institutions can provide important support and access and unblock entrenched challenges for local entities. We have seen similar dynamics through the access to information training in Uganda whereby national ministry officials were in attendance. This builds on the insight around the role of intermediaries in citizen-government engagement: access and back up are key assets that national entities can offer to sub-national ones and local government response to citizen public demand can be supported with national government pressure.

Since Sauti za Wananchi provides a safe and organised way to receive citizen feedback, we see positive response even from historically opaque institutions such as the tax authority.

We have managed to achieve an important victory in successfully transitioning through the change of administration in Makueni: the newly elected Governor has already expressed intentions to continue to work with us. We believe that the following contributed to this: building strong relationships with technical teams many of whom remain in place, specific outreach to the governor's office at key moments, and the timing and concept of the electoral debates.

3. Traditional (national and local) and online media

We work with media in all three countries, serving both an instrumentalist content-driven agenda and the broader aims of protecting civic space. Through the media we are able to offer new approaches to old problems, new evidence on what is going on and to reframe contemporary debates. We can reach many different target audiences at once and we can give wings to our agendas. We do this through media partnerships, inviting media to our events, participating in talk shows and interviews, promoting data points to media electronically, providing micro-grants for citizen-centric and data-driven reporting, supporting early-stage independent digital platforms with a shared agenda and writing opinion pieces in newspapers which are read by government officials.

<u>Kenya:</u>

At national level, we held two launches on election issues and invited media to engage in all of these. We offered diverse content including infographics, short videos, live-streaming and press releases for media to encourage coverage and we held a number of general engagements with media houses to pitch Sauti za Wananchi data to them. We also adopted a new approach of expressing individualized appreciation to every journalist who covered our data and sharing their stories through our social media while acknowledging them publicly.

In Makueni, we held two public events: one for International Women's Day and election debates between candidates for the position of Women's Representative and Senator. We engaged two local language radios, one with national reach, to cover the debates and secured 10 pieces of media coverage including 3 on a local TV station.

In terms of social media, we continued to post regular content updates, be supported by influencers and grow our social media following. We participated in three Tweet Chats hosted by other organisations, and ourselves hosted two Tweet Chats and two Twitter Spaces.

<u>Tanzania:</u>

Media space opened up under the new administration and Twaweza was sought after more frequently for commentary again. We held our first Sauti za Wananchi launch after four years, following public debate about the mobile money levy despite pressure from government not to release the data. We provided timely insertion of key data into a topical debate.

We also engaged extensively with media around key news hooks including international days and were part of a significant volume of coverage generated for CSO Week.

Uganda:

Media engagement in Uganda is one of our key strengths. We continue to offer a mix of content types and use an array of dissemination strategies. We hold events at national and sub-national levels including around topical news hooks, we support talk shows, we run regular data mail outs, we engage national journalists in almost all local field trips, we offer small grants for field work to journalists and we partner with wide-reaching media houses and Uganda Radio Network.

Outcomes

Individual journalists and outlets have increased and improved coverage of civic space issues, citizen voices and agency

Kenya

Traditional media: 5 pieces in dailies, 10 on TV, 21 on radio, and 181 in digital outlets. 963,000 impressions, 2,530 followers on Twitter

Tanzania

Traditional media: 43 print, 47 TV, 72 radio, and 179 in digital outlets 2.6 million impressions, 99,000 followers on Twitter

Uganda

Traditional media: 176 on radio, 45 on TV, 27 print and 72 in digital outlets 664,000 impressions, 1,280 followers on Twitter

Overall, Tanzania has a stronger media presence compared to Kenya and Uganda, with a higher number of traditional and digital media pieces and a larger social media following. However, Kenya has the highest number of digital media pieces, indicating a growing trend towards online media consumption in the country. Uganda continues to secure most coverage on radio which is still the furthest reaching channel. Digital coverage and social media reach has grown in all three countries compared to previous years while traditional media coverage has grown in Kenya and Tanzania and dropped slightly in Uganda. Finally, we note that among the journalists we have been supporting with small field grants in Uganda, two have demonstrated a general increase in their overall coverage of citizen agency and civic space issues.

New outlets arise which are independent, investigative, digital, evidence based, and popular

Tanzania

The Chanzo continues to grow from strength to strength with increased readership across all their platforms. By November 2022 they had an average of 40,000 visits per month to their website compared to between 10,000 and 16,000 before June 2021. They have also expanded their network of correspondents. Their stories are unique and analytical and have exposed corruption, mobilised communities for social support and prompted government process and institutional review. They bring new angles to stories and focus on data journalism. Their financial and operational management strength also continues to grow. And finally, they have been diligent in promoting Twaweza values and ideas including from animation and Sauti za Wananchi and on democratic values and OGP.

In selected geographic areas, community media facilitate citizen-government interaction and highlight local collective action and response

Kenya

Live broadcast on two local radios of Tusemezane debates featuring candidates for women's representative and senator responding to questions and comments from citizens.

Tanzania

Close to 100 programs produced under #MbungeLive local radio program.

A series of features and news items on animation featured in Sibuka FM (over 15), Pangani FM (over 15), Huheso FM (approx 5) and Joy FM (approx 5); journalists from these outlets committed at the Animators' Festival to keep covering animators' stories.

Uganda

19 local radio talk shows and features on animation, around right to know day and Sauti za Wananchi taxation launch.

What we are learning

There is growing demand for high-quality locally relevant journalism, but its supply needs ongoing support. The Chanzo promotes a new type of journalism that has been commended by influential voices. They focus on analysis instead of events. There is no doubt they are promoting alternative narratives - the question is only whether they have a wide enough reach to influence broader public discourse. Nonetheless their perspective and emphasis are much needed in the Tanzanian media landscape. And they do not serve as a lonely voice - there is an increasing numbers of critical independent outlets who ultimately will collectively permeate popular imagination.

Local radios, despite being in desperate need of income, are keen to ensure they are broadcasting high quality content. Therefore, approaches to their editorial teams to frame engagement with Twaweza as a partnership rather than a customer relationship can be beneficial in securing better value for money and greater engagement in the content from the journalists at the radio.

4. Specific ministries and institutions, including ministries of information, legal affairs, local government, and communications regulators

Twaweza uses its creative and credible communications capacity to channel the views and voices collected through our community-based work vertically through different levels of government in Tanzania and Uganda. In all three countries we continue to use Sauti za Wananchi as a platform to collect representative citizen views on democratic freedoms and civic space issues, the issues unearthed through our work in communities including critical service delivery challenges and government mandated entitlements and standards as well as the Sustainable Development Goals. Both of these avenues will serve as mechanisms to reiterate the importance of citizen participation, agency and voice.

Below we summarize howe we engaged with specific ministries and institutions in 2022.

<u>Kenya:</u>

We conducted outreach to relevant ministries in advance of call rounds for input and ownership; we shared the findings in advance of any public engagement and we invited all relevant government institutions to our public launches. This approach, borrowed from Uganda, yielded positive results in terms of government engagement. We reached out extensively to the Independent Electoral and Boundaries Commission (IEBC) and engaged them from the early stages of tool design to help them feel ownership of the data. We shared the findings with them in advance of public events so they were able to prepare their responses. We have similarly partnered closely with the Makueni government in all

stages of data collection and dissemination. We planned for three call rounds at national level in Kenya in 2022 out of which we implemented two and one endline in-person survey in Makueni, which was conducted as planned. In total we shared our data directly in person with 44 policy or decision-makers.

<u>Tanzania:</u>

We engaged with progressive insiders in the Ministry of Finance and had a closed-door presentation to the tax task force who valued the citizen opinion data. We capitalised on an issue that was trending at the time and affected almost every citizen, engaged the Ministry for input and buy-in as well as presenting to officials at the ministry. They responded positively and were open to findings. However, delay tactics were deployed when we expressed our intent to publish the data. The data was released and influenced public debate, and was quoted by government officials. We had planned for three call rounds but instead conducted two both on the economy and mobile money levy. In total we shared our data with over 50 policy or decision-makers including a special task force for tax issues.

And we also engaged government through the Coalition on the Right to Information, support to Tanzania Editors' Forum and publication and dissemination of joint analysis of the media law.

<u>Uganda:</u>

For Uganda Revenue Authority, the Ministry of Finance and the tax justice network provided referrals and entry points. We walked the entire journey from the design stage, with the ministry of finance to ensure ownership of the findings. We shared the brief with them in advance and mentioned that the citizens will be expecting them to respond to the issues arising from the briefs. To ensure that they attended our event we made formal request to the permanent secretary and copied in the commissioner.

We conducted careful pre- and post-data collection engagements with relevant government institutions. We find that extensive media coverage helps to open doors to new institutions as does our historical record of government collaboration. In Uganda, we had planned for three national call rounds and conducted them all. In total we shared our data with approximately 50 policy or decision-makers from seven institutions.

Outcomes

Government officials seek citizen views on policy and laws, have increased insights about citizen challenges

Kenya

Kenya Revenue Authority expressed interest in learning more about the citizens' views on taxation and Twaweza was invited to present the data to them.

Kenya National Bureau of Statistics (KNBS) has asked Twaweza to contribute towards the development of the framework for the collection of citizen-generated data collection on SDGs.

We continued our work with the Ministry of Health with the research for health technical working group to track the vaccine take up and generate insights on the universal health care situation in the country.

The Independent Electoral and Boundaries Commission used Sauti za Wananchi data on election preparedness to inform their work and communications.

Tanzania

The Ministry of Finance and Planning contributed questions to the Sauti za Wananchi platform for the round on the mobile money levy and general attitudes by citizens on the economy and tax.

The Minister subsequently cited those data although slightly disingenuously.

The Ministry of Information, Communications and information Technology has requested Twaweza and partners' joint analysis of the Media Services Act, 2016 on multiple occasions as a key input into their review process.

Uganda

The Senior Economist at the Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development extended an invitation to Twaweza to participate in the tax review processes.

The Ministry of Health continues to invite Twaweza to participate in the social evidence and generation sub-committee on risk management, we attended two meetings.

Uganda Bureau of Statistics (UBOS) expressed interest in working with us to regularly collect livelihoods data. This is an opportunity we are exploring carefully so as to safeguard our independence.

The Parliamentary Forum on water, sanitation and hygiene requested citizens' views on climate change.

Uganda Revenue Authority co-created a call round on citizens' views of taxation with us and used this information to inform their tax education agenda.

Government officials endorse, participate in and create spaces in which they interact directly with citizens

Kenya

The Independent Electoral and Boundaries Commission offered Twaweza space to share our findings on election preparedness. During the session, the voter education, research and communications teams were positive about the data we shared. In many cases, these data confirmed some of their concerns and challenges although before receiving them they did not have any evidence of the same. Subsequently we embarked on a partnership with the IEBC which resulted in their engagement in three public facing events during which they answered questions from CSOs (drawn from CSOs' experiences in engaging in voter education), citizens and media.

During the public launch on gender issues data to mark International Women's Day, the Makueni County Director for Gender, the nominated Member of the County Assembly (who is a member of the gender committee) and Governor Kivutha Kibwana attended the public launch, and engaged with citizens who were drawn from across the County. The governor commended the continued provision of citizen data and reiterated the importance of using citizen-generated data to inform county processes and planning.

Uganda

Local government officials participated in Sauti za Wananchi launches in Tororo and Arua. In both events they welcomed and responded to concerns that were raised by the citizens both during the launch event and the radio talk show held afterwards.

The Uganda Revenue Authority public affairs team provided their staff and brochures to help in addressing the concerns of the citizens. They welcomed the opportunity to participate in post launch spaces where the Sauti za Wananchi data on taxation would be shared.

Government officials make decisions informed by citizen input

Kenya

Through the partnership agreement we signed with the Independent Electoral and Boundaries Commission, they used Sauti za Wananchi data to inform their outreach to arid and semi-arid areas which the data showed had lower engagement with the elections. In addition, the IEBC emphasised the fairness measures in the tallying and counting processes after some concern was demonstrated in the data.

At sub-national level, some of the Sauti za Makueni data was used to inform the drafting of the County Integrated Development Plan more directly by the county officials and indirectly through an event where Twaweza was invited to share the priorities of the Makueni County youth by an organization that was compiling the findings and feeding them into the CIDP.

The Government of Makueni County partners with Twaweza for all call rounds of data.

Tanzania

In Tanzania after releasing data from the round on the mobile money levy, government reduced the maximum levy for money transfer from TZS 7000 to TZS 3000. One of the key findings from the data was that citizens reported to have significantly reduced their use of these services following the introduction of the levy. Additionally, the government did public campaigns to show what projects the money had gone to; the data showed that citizens would be more willing to pay if they knew what the money was used for and that government spending of levy revenue was in line with their own priorities.

Uganda

The Ministry of Finance committed to look into the issue of double taxation, pledging to compile a report that they would submit to the finance committee of parliament to guide the review of the taxation policy.

Uganda Revenue Authority committed to using citizens' views to improve tax administration and tax education.

Government officials encourage their peers to create new spaces for interaction, citizen expression and action, and government responsiveness

NONE

What are we learning?

Sauti za Wananchi remains powerfully influential. Sectoral government ministries, departments or agencies have seen the value of independent citizen-generated data and have used them to make decisions, including significant fiscal ones. However, the systematic inclusion of such data in decision-making remains elusive.

The risk of spinning your wheels in policy engagement is very high. At the time of writing, in early 2023, both the data protection law and the Media Services Act amendments are a far cry from the discussions, feedback and even agreements during stakeholder engagements. There is a tension between trying to respond to invitations to participate and the issue of how genuine and influential those spaces are. Withdrawing is not an option but it is likely that organisations waste extensive time and resource in attempting to honour these potentially empty invitations.

5. Civil Society

Solidarity among civil society organizations in a time of closing civic space is vital, there is greater strength in numbers. We carefully identify civil society organizations to partner with whose values align with ours. We work with instrumental partners to achieve specific outcomes during time-bound interventions. We have also more recently developed a strand of strategic partnerships whereby we identify and assess mission-aligned partners. We then provide a tailored program of support to enhance their institutional capacities on important aspects such as fundraising, financial management, strategic planning and confidence building. Our strategic partners are those organisations with whom we anticipate walking longer journeys and whose work is directly over-lapping with ours. We believe in building the field so as to ensure that there are more diverse, capable, confident CSOs who are willing to defend democratic values and principles and thus promote and protect open civic space.

Tanzania:

We provided support to our implementing partners for the animation process in Pangani (PACOPA), Maswa (KASODEFO), Mbogwe (MBODANET). We also continued our partnership with Equality for Growth to conscientise and support market women to claim their rights while supporting EfG to grow as an organisation. Similarly, we continued to partner with the Creative Industry Network Tanzania (CINT) to support them to strategise and carry out their activities and grow their organization. We also continued to help them to build linkages to civil society orgasnisations through facilitating their participation in CSO Week and enhanced their media engagement through connections with our media partners and an early year press conference on the distribution of royalties to artists.

We also continued our support to Tanzania Centre for Democracy by supporting them to finalise the operational elements of their new strategy including the budget and an annual plan. We also supported the participation of their staff and committee in their landmark Healing the Wounds conference which attempted to bring together all the major political parties in Tanzania to start a reconciliation process and which was attended by the President. At the conference, the President made an initial commitment to revoke the ban on political party rallies as part of the process of healing national rifts.

And finally, we played a lead role in CSO Week 2022 including supporting partners to attend (The Chanzo, Equality for Growth, CINT) and hosting multiple capacity sessions including on futures thinking. We subsequently engaged with a small group of CSOs from the Kilimanjaro Region to provide key skills in the areas of budgets and audits, participating in by-law processes, monitoring, evaluation and learning, media and advocacy, animation and community listening and fundraising.

<u>Uganda:</u>

We continued to develop the capacity of animators and people's committees including through exchange visits between districts.

We also continued to engage and collaborate with all relevant CSOs through our Sauti za Wananchi public launches.

<u>Kenya:</u>

Twaweza took part in the Devolution Conference and met the Organisation of African Youth, who became our youth partners. They also provided us with new opportunities such us our involvement in the Women Representative debate in Kisumu County where we presented the elections preparedness data.

Outcomes

Unusual actors mobilize, coalesce and work together to take specific actions in defense of democracy

Tanzania

Animators advocate for citizen voice and agency in all the communities in which they operate.

Market women are engaging with government officials and politicians to demand improved rights and services.

Creative Industry Network Tanzania are involved in a range of regulatory discussions with government around arts council regulations, copyright, and tax policies. Although none of these have been fully finalised, there seems to be strong appetite on the part of government to ensure artist voices are considered as they look to improve the regulatory environment. In addition, changes have been made to the Copyright Act in line with submissions made by CINT to the responsible ministry.

Worked with international organisations, NGOs and media to commemorate World Press Freedom Day and secured public political commitments from the minister to amend regressive media laws.

Citizens express trust in civil society and view their work as constructive and critical

NONE

CSOs have increased advocacy, financial management and fundraising capacities

Kenya

We made inroads towards supporting civil society organisations to access data for use in their advocacy work thus enabling them to be more evidence based.

Tanzania

Through our critical feedback exercise, partners and other NGOs acknowledge our contribution in providing support to others. Capacity support to district partners is being assessed through longitudinal studies.

Uganda

Capacity support to district partners is being assessed through longitudinal studies. National CSOs are able to conduct evidence-based advocacy using our data.

Individual activists are better organised, networked, resourced, skilled and tooled

Kenya

Mzalendo Trust, a CSO reported to be using the Sauti za Wananchi data on elections to inform the Jihusishe program they were undertaking to mobilise the youth to take part in the elections.

The Organisation of African Youth, a youth-led and focused organisation co-created the first round on elections and joined in the dissemination. They used this data to inform their civic engagement youth mobilisation programs

Tanzania

The Animators' Festival feedback was positive. Animators learned and immediately used self-care techniques for stress relief. They are also better networked with stronger connections with each other and a number of new ideas and strategies to apply to their work as shared by their peers. Post event feedback: Over 90% of participants met and exchanged contacts with animators from new area, over 80% said they learned something they could apply to their work and that bringing them together re-inspired them around animation, and 70% said they have no ideas and methods for attempting to solve challenges they are facing in their work.

All the nine CSOs in the Arusha workshop said they learned new skills that they will apply in their work and share with their colleagues through our capacity exchange sessions. They claimed that they intend to remain connected with each other and Twaweza.

Four capacity sessions on the NGO Act, Learning, Monitoring and Evaluation, Media and Communications, Animation during CSO Week, with 100 or more attendees each morning despite the 730am start. Many of the attendees at the animation session were excited by the methodology and keen to explore its use in their own work.

Uganda

We supported CSOs through providing data for their engagement and advocacy. These include VijanaCorps, International Right to Know Day (with Africa Freedom of Information Centre) and Uganda Editors' Guild.

What are we learning?

We continue to be an important hub of information, ideas, execution and strategic financing for mission-aligned civil society partners across the three countries. Careful curation of our collaboration with selected ministries and departments in Uganda has ensured we are influential to a degree significantly greater than our size in the country. In Tanzania, our ongoing principled stand in defense of freedom of expression has encouraged others to raise their voices even when faced with the possibility of retribution.

Our focus on civil society engagements and media partnerships help to strengthen the sector and contribute to providing counter-balancing forces to the dominant power wielded by the government. Moving forward, we need to return to direct government engagement around our data, ideas and experiences and we wish to generate media debate on critical issues through our data. However, we must acknowledge that feedback from our critical friends remains mixed in terms how our engagements with other NGOs some peers are assessed. Some are extremely positive, but others continue to describe us as arrogant and uncollaborative.

Wider Societal Outcomes

For many of the wider societal outcomes, implementation is described above.

1. Citizens

Outcomes

Citizens perceive space to engage with authorities for problem-solving and accountability; they are able (and allowed) to hold leaders accountable.

Citizens have a sense of improved government services, and improved accountability

Our endline and midline surveys in 2023 will provide evidence of community members' not directly involved in our participation work perceptions of service delivery and governance, to understand if the effects of the intervention resonate more widely.

2. Media

Outcomes

National media hold meaningful (informed and participatory) debates and dialogues on civic space and service delivery

National media cite evidence/data from a range of government and independent sources

In 2023, we are exploring assessment of our broader media influence beyond quantity and quality of coverage of our problem areas.

3. Government processes

Outcomes

The actions and processes and mechanisms implemented by (early adopter) government actors begin to influence other government actors and shape institutions, policies, laws and practice

Kenya

We are working with Kenya National Bureau of Statistics to create frameworks for their and other government institutions' use of citizen-generated data.

Uganda

The ministry of finance referred us to Uganda Revenue Authority who were more willing to engage with us as a result. We find these referrals are often easy to secure and help to open doors to new government institutions.

The ministry of ICT have supported our local access to information trainings through high level presence thus exerting more pressure on local government officials to attend and engage; their endorsement of the process and the importance of the law and citizen participation more broadly help to emphasise Twaweza values.

Parliamentary debates, including at committee level, on new laws governing access to information, freedom of expression and civic participation are more inclusive of citizen views and voices

Tanzania

Promulgation of new arts' council regulations have been held until the Creative Industry Network Tanzania can provide artists' perspectives on the same.

Stakeholder consultation processes held on multiple civic space laws coordinated by the Tanganyika Law Society. Unfortunately, this exercise while comprehensive seems to have stalled before completion.

There is less use by government of certificates of urgency to pass or amend laws touching on civic space. More time is being offered for public consultations.

What are we learning?

"All that glitters is not gold!" The numerous government invitations to participate in public consultations or submit input intended to inform the reform of laws generates much excitement. We try to take advantage of every consultation to which we are invited to demonstrate our readiness to engage constructively with government. When, as has frequently happened, these processes stall, it turns out to

have been far less promising than first imagined. We are learning to distinguish between promising opportunities for real change and those resource-intensive distractions.

4. Legal and policy environment

Twaweza convened a coalition of organisations to submit a joint analysis on the prohibitive amendments to the COSTECH Act. These were also shared with high level government officials ultimately resulting in the withdrawal of these proposed amendments in their entirety.

We also provided analysis of a set of amendments to laws governing the criminal justice system. We submitted our comments in writing and our partner, Legal and Human Rights Centre, supported us to present the comments to the relevant parliamentary committee when we were unable to travel to Dodoma.

Twaweza supported Jamii Forums in developing the advocacy strategy around the data protection law and attended their stakeholder engagements as well as presenting alongside them during the committee hearings.

Through our partnership with Creative Industry Network Tanzania, we have been part of advocating and engaging on the copyright issue for months. This includes a press conference on the distribution of copyright royalties which had been carried out with no transparency or accountability.

Outcomes

Restrictive clauses in national and local laws governing access to information, freedom of expression and civic participation are used less, some have been amended

Tanzania

Restrictive amendments to the act to establish the Commission for Science and Technology were withdrawn after collaborative analysis and insider outreach to high level government officials.

The main problematic amendment proposed in the laws around criminal justice (blanket immunity for undercover police officers during operations) was struck out by MPs during committee level debates, in line with our analysis.

Data Protection Act was passed after demand from stakeholders. Unfortunately, it embeds double standards for governmental and independent data collection and places onerous restrictions on the latter. There is scope for this to be redressed in the regulations which operationalize the law.

The Finance Act was amended to partially improve the environment for artists' royalties' collection and distribution.

Public commitments were made by the Minister of Information to amend media laws.

What we are learning

Evidence, voice and collaboration work... sometimes. We have clear instances of direct representation from affected communities – artists, market women – influencing policy, practice and decisions. And we have many examples of constructive engagement and evidence-based advocacy yielding concrete results. Yet we have as many, if not more, examples of the same approaches falling flat or producing little affect. We are reflecting on possible common threads between our successful engagements although much seems to be connected with wider political and economic imperatives. Therefore, our analysis of the wider dynamics in our landscape and their potential for influencing, positively or negatively, our achievement of our outcomes needs to become even sharper.